

**Saginaw-Tittabawassee Rivers Contamination CAG
Summary of Full CAG Meeting
Saginaw Valley State University – Curtiss Hall
Monday, April 16, 2012
6:00 PM – 8:23 PM**

CAG Members Present

Drummond Black
Charles Curtiss
Leonard Heinzman
Matthew de Huis
Ryan Jankoska
Wendy Kanar
Michael Kelly
Rachel Larimore
Judith Lincoln
David Myer
Joel Tanner
Bob Weise
William Webber
Paul Vasold

CAG Members Absent

Annette Rummel
Jeffrey Bulls
Deborah Huntley
Janet McGuire
Laura Ogar

Ex-Officio Members Present

Todd Konechne, Dow Chemical
Joe Haas, US FWS
Mary Logan, US EPA
Al Taylor, Michigan MDEQ

Support and Agency Staff Present

Helen Dawson, US EPA
Deb MacKenzie-Taylor, MDEQ
Tim Prendiville, US EPA
Diane Russell, US EPA
Mary Breeden, US EPA
Janelle Pistro, Dow Chemical

Judith Lincoln called the meeting to order at 6:03 pm. Agenda items included:

- Leadership Team Updates
- Project Updates
- Presentation on EPA Dioxin Reassessment

1. Leadership Team Update

- Form 990 has been submitted.
- CAG leadership is waiting for members to express an interest in a boat tour; if interested, CAG members should let a leadership team member know. Depending on interest, a boat tour may be scheduled.
- Judy Lincoln will be stepping down from the leadership team effective next month; if any CAG member is interested in serving on the team, please contact current leadership team members.
- The CAG continues to seek members to represent the Hispanic community.

2. Project Updates

- Segment 1 Work for 2012 – Todd Konechne stated that work in Segment 1 is progressing. He went through the selected remedies for Segment 1, and presented a calendar for the work.
- EPA Community Outreach – Diane Russell reported that since the last CAG meeting, the EPA has done two outreach events. EPA partner Bay County Health Department has distributed over 500 “Eat Safe Fish” brochures. EPA and the BCHD have assisted at several school presentations of “Lessons from the Bald Eagle”, reaching over 2,000 students. The second component of the school program is school field trips to the Bay City State Park, which begin today.
- Upcoming events include an EPA Saginaw Community Information Office open house on April 27 from 1 pm to 5 pm and on April 28 from 10 am to 2 pm, and the Saginaw Children’s Zoo Earth Day event on April 28.
- The next issue of the newsletter should be distributed within the next few weeks.

3. Presentation on EPA Dioxin Reassessment

Helen Dawson, Chief of EPA’s OSRTI Science Policy Branch, gave a presentation titled EPA’s Risk Assessment Process and Application to Dioxin. The first part of the presentation discussed the definition of dioxins, EPA’s risk assessment process, reference doses (RfD), and the use of RfD at Superfund sites. Other topics included health impacts of dioxin, potential environmental risks, toxicity assessment, history of EPA dioxin assessment activities, non-cancer toxicity values for dioxin, cancer toxicity values for dioxin, setting site-specific preliminary remediation goals and cleanup levels, bioavailability, and what the EPA considers in selecting a remedy.

- CAG Question: How are sites determined when deciding on where to test for dioxin?
Helen: testing depends on the kinds of soil involved.
- CAG Question: What does 100% mean when talking about bioavailability?
Helen: It means 100% of what you ingest.
- CAG Question: Is dioxin bioavailability site-specific?
Helen: That cannot be said at this time.

- CAG Question: The MSU study on fish and birds showed a lower accumulation in kingfishers; is that bioavailability?
Deb MacKenzie-Taylor: There are too many unknown variables in that study; what kind of fish have the kingfishers eaten in the past is unknown.
- CAG Question: How much of the dioxin data is based on human data?
Helen: Values are based on epidemiological data.
- CAG Question: We had a presentation on the U of M study – what is your opinion on that?
Helen: It was one part of the hundreds of studies we went over in my office.
- CAG Question: Concerning the new dioxin formula – what numbers is the EPA using for cleanup?
Mary Logan: No site-specific numbers have been finalized; and, sediment and soils are different in different places.
- CAG Question: I assume you don't have studies showing the 50 parts per trillion.
Helen: You can look at the EPA website, which has human studies and animal studies.
- CAG Question: I want studies showing who got cancer due to dioxin – are we going to have some cancer numbers?
Helen: Yes, the EPA is working on that.
- CAG Question: Will what we know about the non-cancerous dioxins change how we're cleaning up?
Mary Logan: We are still moving upstream to downstream – no, it does not change the process much.
- CAG Question: Some dioxins are not so bad. On our site, what are the kinds of dioxin we need to be concerned about?
Deb Mackenzie Taylor: You first need to know if you're talking about sediment, soil, or fish.
- CAG Question: Seems like there's two opposing views; no deaths have been attributed to dioxin but dioxin can be cancerous.
Helen: The EPA agrees that dioxin can cause cancer. Scientists will always diverge on their views. The EPA does not assume that a cancer is caused by dioxin.

Ms. Dawson's PowerPoint presentation will be posted on the CAG webpage.

4. Public questions and comments

- Public: I'm disappointed that you didn't talk about non-cancerous toxicity.
Helen: I talked about that in the part of my presentation that addressed what can contribute to dioxin TEQ.
CAG: Remember, we often don't have a good idea on what else people were exposed to. The number of population studies is fairly low; hard to say if effects are due to a specific chemical.
- Public: When my property floods, is the dioxin level getting worse?
Al Taylor: Typically we aren't seeing the highest concentrations at the surface. As the cleanup goes on, cleaner and cleaner soil should be coming in with floodwater. We are working on a site-wide monitoring program.
- Public: When EPA releases their cancer study, will there be a reference dose?
Helen: No, it will be presented as a reference slope. The study is still in EPA's research and development office.

- Public: This site has a long history of contaminated fish; do you anticipate enhanced fish advisories?

Helen: In general, the EPA uses fish advisories. In this case, I'll defer to the State.

- Public: Is this all linear data?

Helen: No, we haven't talked about that here.

Meeting was adjourned at 8:17 p.m.